## Plenary

Meeting date:
Tuesday, 20 March 2012

Meeting time:
13:30

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru
National
Assembly for
Wales


## Votes and Proceedings

(54)v3

## Election of a Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer

Rhodri Glyn Thomas was elected as temporary Deputy Presiding Officer.

1. Questions to the First Minister

The item started at 13:30.
Questions 2-14 were asked. Question 1 was withdrawn. The Presiding Officer invited party leaders to ask questions to the First Minister after Question 2.
2. Business Statement and Announcement

The item started at 14.28
3. Statement by the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development: A Programme for Eradicating Bovine Tuberculosis in Wales

The item started at 14:34.
4. The Mobile Homes Act 1983 (Jurisdiction of Residential Property Tribunals) (Wales) Order 2012

The item started at 15:27.
The motion was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.
5. Debate: The annual report for 2010-11 of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales (ESTYN)

The item started at 15:34.
NDM4943 Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)
To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Notes the annual report for 2010-11 of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales.
The following amendments were tabled:

## Amendment 1 - Jocelyn Davies (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:
Further notes that the report says that 'Wales still has problems of low level literacy' and 'improving pupils' literacy is not central enough to the design of the school curriculum.'

Amendment 1 was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.
Amendment 2 - William Graham (South Wales East)
Add as new point at end of motion:
Regrets findings in the annual report which suggest 4 in 10 pupils entering secondary school have a reading age of at least 6 months below their actual age.

Amendment 2 was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

## Amendment 3 - William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:
Expresses deep concern that 5\% of schools inspected caused Estyn 'serious concern', whilst $25 \%$ required follow-up visits.

Amendment 3 was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

## Amendment 4 - William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:
Regrets findings from Estyn suggesting that in many schools improving pupils' literacy is not central enough to the design of the school curriculum.

Amendment 4 was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

## Amendment 5 - William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:
Regrets findings in the annual report which suggest a wide variation in teaching standards across Wales.

Amendment 5 was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.
Voting on the motion and remaining amendments under this item was deferred until Voting Time.

## Amendment 6 - Peter Black (South Wales West)

Add as a new point at end of motion:

Regrets that the Welsh Government is not required to provide a written response to the annual report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales.
A vote was taken on Amendment 6:

| For | Abstain | Against | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | 13 | 39 | 57 |

## Amendment 6 was not agreed.

## Amendment 7 - Peter Black (South Wales West)

Add as a new point at end of motion:
Calls on the Welsh Government to create a legal requirement for it to respond formally, in writing, to future Estyn annual reports.

A vote was taken on Amendment 7:

| For | Abstain | Against | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | 13 | 39 | 57 |

## Amendment 7 was not agreed.

## Amendment 8 - Peter Black (South Wales West)

Add as a new point at end of motion:
Welcomes the introduction of the Pupil Deprivation Grant in Wales and the potential for improving achievement for pupils in receipt of free school meals.
A vote was taken on Amendment 8:

| For | Abstain | Against | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 34 | 23 | 0 | 57 |

Amendment 8 was agreed.

## Amendment 9 - Peter Black (South Wales West)

Add as a new point at end of motion:
Regrets that the banding of schools will do little to address the Chief Inspector of Education and Training's statement that, 'Even where a school is judged 'good' overall, there are often individual lessons or departments where the quality of teaching or learning is poor'.
A vote was taken on Amendment 9:

| For | Abstain | Against | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 28 | 0 | 29 | 57 |

Amendment 9 was not agreed.

## Amendment 10 - Peter Black (South Wales West)

Add as a new point at end of motion:

Regrets the evidence in the Report which suggests that several local authorities are unaware of how their schools are performing and that some schools have been 'allowed to under-perform over a long period of time'.
A vote was taken on Amendment 10:

| For | Abstain | Against | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 57 | 0 | 0 | 57 |

## Amendment 10 was agreed.

## Amendment 11 - Peter Black (South Wales West)

Add as a new point at end of motion:
Regrets the fact that timescales for educational improvement set by the Welsh Government are inconsistent.

A vote was taken on Amendment 11:

| For | Abstain | Against | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 18 | 0 | 39 | 57 |

## Amendment 11 was not agreed.

## Amendment 12 - Peter Black (South Wales West)

Add as a new point at end of motion:
Calls on the Welsh Government to introduce interim targets to ensure that it meets its overall target for the Welsh schools system to be in the world's top 20 by 2015.
A vote was taken on Amendment 12:

| For | Abstain | Against | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 18 | 0 | 39 | 57 |

Amendment 12 was not agreed.
A vote was taken on the motion as amended:

## NDM4943 Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:
Notes the annual report for 2010-11 of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales.

Further notes that the report says that 'Wales still has problems of low level literacy' and 'improving pupils' literacy is not central enough to the design of the school curriculum.

Regrets findings in the annual report which suggest 4 in 10 pupils entering secondary school have a reading age of at least 6 months below their actual age.

Expresses deep concern that 5\% of schools inspected caused Estyn 'serious concern', whilst $25 \%$ required follow-up visits.

Regrets findings from Estyn suggesting that in many schools improving pupils' literacy is not central enough to the design of the school curriculum.

Regrets findings in the annual report which suggest a wide variation in teaching standards across Wales.

Welcomes the introduction of the Pupil Deprivation Grant in Wales and the potential for improving achievement for pupils in receipt of free school meals.

Regrets the evidence in the Report which suggests that several local authorities are unaware of how their schools are performing and that some schools have been 'allowed to under-perform over a long period of time'.

| For | Abstain | Against | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 57 | 0 | 0 | 57 |

The motion as amended was agreed.
6. Debate: The Welsh Government's strategic agenda for science and innovation "Science for Wales"

The item started at 16.27

## NDM4942 Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:
Notes the new strategic agenda for science and innovation in Wales - Science for Wales.

The following amendments were tabled:

## Amendment 1 - William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:
Regrets that Wales' share of UK research council funding in 2009/10 was 'just 3.3\%'.
Amendment 1 was agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

## Amendment 2 - William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:
Regrets the 'decline in GCSE take up of STEM subjects and the fact that take up at ' A ' level has not increased in line with overall 'A' level entries.'.

Amendment 2 was agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

## Amendment 3 - William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:
Calls for the Welsh Government to introduce a programme encouraging highly talented people into STEM subject teaching.

Amendment 3 was agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

## Amendment 4 - William Graham (South Wales East)

Add as new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Government to encourage more businesses in Wales to invest in business enterprise research and development (BERD) and to access EU Framework Programme funding for this purpose.

Amendment 4 was agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

## Amendment 5 - Peter Black (South Wales West)

Add as new point at end of motion:
Calls for the Welsh Government to produce a delivery plan outlining key action points and setting definable targets for improving science and innovation.

Amendment 5 was agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

## Amendment 6 - Peter Black (South Wales West)

Add as new point at end of motion:
Calls on the Minister for Education and Skills to provide clarity on the position of science as a core subject indicator in schools.

Amendment 6 was agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.
A vote was taken on the motion as amended:

## NDM4942 Jane Hutt (Vale of Glamorgan)

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:
Notes the new strategic agenda for science and innovation in Wales - Science for Wales.
Regrets that Wales' share of UK research council funding in 2009/10 was 'just 3.3\%'.
Regrets the 'decline in GCSE take up of STEM subjects and the fact that take up at ' $A$ ' level has not increased in line with overall ' $A$ ' level entries.'.

Calls for the Welsh Government to introduce a programme encouraging highly talented people into STEM subject teaching.

Calls on the Welsh Government to encourage more businesses in Wales to invest in business enterprise research and development (BERD) and to access EU Framework Programme funding for this purpose.

Calls for the Welsh Government to produce a delivery plan outlining key action points and setting definable targets for improving science and innovation.
Calls on the Minister for Education and Skills to provide clarity on the position of science as a core subject indicator in schools.

The motion as amended was agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 12.36

## Voting Time

The item started at 17.29

The meeting concluded at 17.35
The Assembly will sit again in Plenary at 13:30, Wednesday, 21 March 2012

